

This syllabus will start this course on January 29, 2019. It is very important to me, however, to design this course according to the theoretical and research interests of students who enroll in it. Thus, while this syllabus reflects how we will proceed, at an early stage in the semester we will have a conversation among seminar members about their own research interests and how I might alter parts of the syllabus (but not in the first weeks) to address those interests. Thus, depending on students' decisions in the seminar, some of the later part of the syllabus might change in order to accommodate their immediate interests.

**Ph.D./M.A. Program in Political Science
The Graduate Center of the City University of New York**

P SC 87800 Comparative Political Orders

Spring Semester 2019

**Professor Susan L. Woodward
Office Hours: Wednesdays, 3 to 4**

**Tuesdays, 4:15 to 6:15
Seminar Room: 3308**

Course Description

The empirically dominant and normatively preferred form of contemporary political order is based on the historical model of west European state formation and theorists, above all Max Weber, of the modern state. The primary reason for this, however, is international order: sovereignty as defined and consolidated after 1945 and the requirements of participating in the current international system. Once we look to domestic political order, we not only see a historically rich literature on alternatives that tends to be ignored to our detriment, but also a vast variety of domestic political orders, the challenges and tasks they address politically, and ways of analyzing contemporary political orders that are not driven by comparison with this dominant model. In addition, to the extent that historical legacies matter for political order, understanding the way empires (e.g., the Ottomans, colonial powers) organized political life also informs current countries that succeeded them.

The seminar will be organized around a set of theoretical questions to escape that “western state” straightjacket and a literature on alternatives. It also, however, aims to provide an opportunity to students to pose their own question for the group and for thinking creatively through their research project and paper. The focus of all the readings and discussion will be comparative, primarily but not entirely outside Europe. The topics should be clear from the syllabus below.

Requirements and Grading

There are four requirements for this seminar:
(1) participation in class on the readings for the week, actively and critically;

- (2) a one-page, typed summary of the issues/theories of the readings for each week and at least one critical question you have of the readings or that you think the readings raise, due in class on the day of those readings;
- (3) an outline of your eventual research paper, with its components identified (to be discussed further in class), due in class on March 12; and
- (4) the eventual research paper, typed, double-spaced, and due, in my mail box, either physically at the GC or electronically in my email, on May 14, at 5:00 p.m.

The final grade will be a composite of these four: 25% for each of (1) and (2); 10% for (3); and 40% for (4), with due attention to progress over the semester.

It is important for you to know that I do not accept late writing assignments. Clearly there are some legitimate excuses – medical or family emergency – but they must be documented. This is a very difficult requirement for some, not to speak of for me to enforce, but part of graduate education is socialization, and the world out there professionally does not accept late submissions, so it is very important for you to learn how to deal with this psychologically (that you want to keep working on something to make it “better”) as well as administratively (that to meet deadlines, one has to plan).

Reading Assignments and Books

The readings for this course will be largely journal articles that you will find through the online journals of the library or book chapters and inaccessible journal articles that are placed on Blackboard. A hard copy of each book is on reserve at the library. This system applies only to the required readings, except for a few recommended readings that might be difficult to find and, thus, are also placed on Blackboard. Course documents in Blackboard are organized into folders by weeks in the syllabus. Where portions of a book are assigned, but the library does not yet own the book (it will have been ordered), those pages will also be placed on Blackboard.

We will not read very large parts of books, so their assigned pages will be on BlackBoard and/or on Reserves, but you may wish to purchase:

Karen Barkey (2008), *Empire of Difference: The Ottomans in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press), and

Stephen van Evera (1997), *Guide to Methods for Students of Political Science* (Cornell University Press).

I always recommend using the Amazon link on the Mina Rees Library page because purchase through Amazon on that link contributes a portion of the sale to our library, but you should choose a local bookstore if you prefer.

Seminar Schedule

January 29 Introduction

1. February 5 An entrée into thinking about a different reality

Abdul Raufu Mustapha, "States, Predation & Violence: Reconceptualizing Political Action and Political Community in Africa" (10th General Assembly of CODESRIA, December 2002).

Volker Boege, Anne Brown, Kevin Clements, and Anna Nolan (2010), "What is Failing: States in the Global South or Research and Politics in the West?" in Martina Fischer and Beatrix Schmelzle (eds.). *Building Peace in the Absence of States: Challenging the Discourse on State Failure*. Berlin: Berghof Handbook Dialogue No. 8, pp. 15-35. Available at www.berghof-handbook.net/std_page.php?LANG=e&id=5.

Kenneth Menkhaus, "Governance without Government in Somalia: Spoilers, State Building and the Politics of Coping," *International Security* 31: 3 (Winter 2006/2007): 74-106.

Antonio Giustozzi, "Afghanistan: Transition without End," Crisis States Research Center (CSRC) Working Paper (WP) 40 (November 2008); (on BB and available at: www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx)

Karen Barkey (1994), *Bandits and Bureaucrats: The Ottoman Route to State Centralization*, chs. 1 and 7 (pp. 1-23; 229-42).

Alex de Waal (2015), *The Real Politics of the Horn of Africa: Money, War and the Business of Power*, pp. 1-22, 29-34, 196-99.

Recommended:

Tanja A. Börzel and Thomas Risse, "Governance without a state: Can it work?" *Regulation and Governance* (2010), 4: 113-134 (placed on BB).

Gianfranco Poggi, "The State," *International Encyclopedia of Political Science*.

Quentin Skinner, "How we acquired the concept of the state (and what concept(s) we acquired)," unpub. ms. [n.d.] (available from Prof. Woodward).

Ernst Kantorowicz (1957), *The King's Two Bodies*.

J. P. Nettl (1968), "The State as a Conceptual Variable," *World Politics* 20 (July): 539-592.

February 12 Graduate Center closed for President's Day

2. February 19 Alternative conceptual and/or theoretical approaches

James Ferguson and Akhil Gupta (2002), "Spatializing States: Toward an Ethnography of Neoliberal Governmentality," *American Ethnologist* 29: 4, pp. 981-1002.

Clifford Geertz, "Centers, Kings, and Charisma: Reflections on the Symbolics of Power," in Geertz, (1983) *Local Knowledge: Further Essays in Interpretive Anthropology*: 121-46.

Sudipta Kaviraj (2005), "On the enchantment of the state: Indian thought on the role of the state in the narrative of modernity," *Archives Européennes de sociologie*, XLVI: 2: 263-296.

Tobias Hagmann and Didier Péclard (2010), "Negotiating Statehood: Dynamics of Power and Domination in Africa," *Development and Change* 41: 4, pp. 539-562. (For those interested, read among the case studies that follow, on the Congo-Uganda border, Namibia, Ethiopia, Angola, Guinea, Mozambique, Côte d'Ivoire, and Somaliland).

Michel Foucault (1991), "Governmentality," in G. Burchell, C. Gordon and P. Miller (eds), *The Foucault Effect*, pp. 87-104.

Pierre Bourdieu (1994), "Rethinking the State: Genesis and Structure of the Bureaucratic Field," *Sociological Theory* 12:1, pp. 1-18.

Elinor Ostrom. "A Long Polycentric Journey," *Annual Review of Political Science*, 13: 1-23. (If you want more, go to her Nobel Prize lecture: "Beyond Markets and States: Polycentric Governance of Complex Economic Systems," December 8, 2009)

Lisa Wedeen. 2008. *Peripheral Visions: Publics, Power, and Performance in Yemen*, ch. 3, "The Politics of Deliberation: Qat Chews as Public Spheres," pp. 103-147.

Recommended:

Douglass C. North, John Joseph Wallis, Steven B. Webb, and Barry R. Weingast (2007), "Limited Access Orders in the Developing World: A New Approach to the Problems of Development," *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4359* (September), access at: www.econ.worldbank.org. They went on to publish an entire book on the subject: *In the Shadow of Violence: Politics, Economics, and the Problems of Development* (2012).

Paul Cammack, "Review Article: Bringing the State Back In?" *British Journal of Political Science*, 19:2 (April 1989): 261-290.

Michael Mann, "The Autonomous Power of the State," *Archives Européennes de Sociologie* 25 (19) (1984): 185-213.

Timothy Mitchell (1991), "The Limits of the State: Beyond the Statist Approaches and their Critics," *American Political Science Review* 85: 1 (77-96).

3. February 26 Studying variation

David Collier (1993), "The Comparative Method," in Ada W. Finifter, ed., *Political Science: The State of the Discipline II*, pp. 105-19 [on BB]

Barbara Geddes (1990), "How the Cases You Choose Affect the Answers You Get: Selection Bias and related Issues," *Political Analysis* 2: 131-50, or also in Geddes (2003), *Paradigms and Sand Castles: Theory Building and Research Design in Comparative Politics*, ch. 3.

Stephen Van Evera (1997), *Guide to Methods for Students of Political Science* (Cornell), ch 1 and the Appendix; read the rest of the book if you are thinking about your dissertation.

Charles Tilly (1984), *Big Structures, Large Processes, Huge Comparisons*, chs. 7-9 (pp. 116-47).

James Mahoney (1999), "Nominal, Ordinal, and Narrative Appraisal in Macrocausal Analysis," *American Journal of Sociology* 104:4 (January): 1154-96.

Recommended:

Henry Brady and David Collier, eds. (2010), *Rethinking Social Inquiry: Diverse Tools, Shared Standards*, 2nd ed., especially the Glossary.

David Collier and James Mahoney (1996), "Insights and Pitfalls: Selection Bias in Qualitative Research," *World Politics* 49:1, pp. 56-91 (especially the discussion of Geddes' article on pp. 80-87 and the conclusion, pp. 88-91).

James Mahoney (2010), "After KKV: The New Methodology of Qualitative Research," *World Politics* 62: 1 (January): 120-47.

Giovanni Capoccia and R. Daniel Kelemen (2007), "The Study of Critical Junctures: Theory, Narrative, and Counterfactuals in Historical Institutionalism," *World Politics* 59 (April): 341-69.

John Gerring (2001), *Social Science Methodology: Tasks, Strategies, Criteria*.

Alexander George and Andrew Bennett (2005), *Case Studies and Theory Development in the Social Sciences*.

Peter Hall (1990), "Helpful Hints for Writing Dissertations in Comparative Politics," *PS: Political Science and Politics* 23:4 (December): 596-98.

4. March 5 Empire

Karen Barkey (2008), *Empire of Difference: The Ottomans in Comparative Perspective*, Part I (pp. 1-191) and introduction to Part II (pp.193-6).

John Gerring, Daniel Ziblatt, Johan van Gorp, and Julián Arévalo (2011), "An Institutional Theory of Direct and Indirect Rule," *World Politics* 63:3 (July) 377-433.

Sean L. Yom and F. Gregory Gause, III, "Resilient Royals: How Arab Monarchies Hang On," *Journal of Democracy*, 23:4 (October 2012): 74-88.

Jane Burbank and Frederick Cooper (2010), *Empires in World History: Power and the Politics of Difference*, ch. 1 (1-22).

James Tong, "Rational outlaws: rebels and bandits in the Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644," in Mark Taylor, ed., (1988), *Rationality and Revolution*: 98-128.

Recommended:

Benedict Anderson (1991), *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, 2nd ed., chs. 6 ("Official Nationalism and Imperialism") and 10 ("Census, Map, Museum"), pp. 85-114, 167-90.

S.N. Eisenstadt (1963), *The Political System of Empires*.

Michael Doyle (1986), *Empires*.

Perry Anderson (1974), *Lineages of the Absolutist State* (including "The House of Islam," "Japanese Feudalism," and "The Asiatic Mode of Production").

Crawford Young (1994), *The African Colonial State in Comparative Perspective*.

Mahmood Mamdani (1996), *Citizen and Subject: Contemporary Africa and the Legacy of Late Colonialism*.

5. March 12 Frontiers/Borderlands

Janet Roitman (1998), "The Garrison-Entrepôt," *Cahiers d'Études Africaines* 150-152, 38: 2-4, pp. 297-329.

Ariel Ahram and Charles King (2010), "The Warlord as Arbitrageur," *Theory and Society*, DOI 27 November 2011: 1-18.

John S. Galbraith, "The 'Turbulent Frontier' as a Factor in British Expansion," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 2:2 (January 1960): 150-168.

James C. Scott (2009), *The Art of Not Being Governed: An Anarchist History of Upland Southeast Asia*, preface and chs. 1, 2, and conclusion (1-63, 324-338).

Lisa Blaydes (2017), "State Building in the Middle East," *Annual Review of Political Science*, vol. 20: 487-504.

Recommended Readings:

James Ron (2003), *Frontiers and Ghettos: State Violence in Serbia and Israel*.

Joel Migdal, ed. (2004). *Boundaries and Belongings: States and Societies and the Struggle to Shape Identities and Local Practices*, ch 5, "Making Myanmar: Language, Territory, and Belonging in Post-Socialist Burma" (99-120) and conclusion, 3-26 and 339-358.

Jeffrey Herbst (2000), *States and Power in Africa: Comparative Lessons in Authority and Control*, chs. 1 and 9 (pp. 11-31, 251-272); recommend: ch. 2 (35-57).

Justin V. Hastings (2010), *No Man's Land: Globalization, Territory, and Clandestine Groups in Southeast Asia*.

Mark Bradbury and Margaret Kleinman (2010) *Winning Hearts and Minds? Examining the Relationship Between Aid and Security in Kenya*, Feinstein International Center, Tufts University: Medford, MA (April): 4-7, 12-19, 51-2, and 72-3 (read as much more as you wish).

March 19: Hand-in your proposed research question for your term paper.

6. March 19 Alternatives to the modern state

Hendrik Spruyt (1996), *The Sovereign State and Its Competitors: An Analysis of Systems Change*, introduction, chs. 3 and 6 (pp. 3-8; 34-57; and 109-129).

Michel Oksenberg (2001), "The Issue of Sovereignty in the Asian Historical Context," in S. Krasner, ed., *Problematic Sovereignty: Contested Rules and Political Possibilities*, pp. 83-104.

L. Lily Tsai (2007). "Solidary Groups, Informal Accountability, and Local Public Goods Provision in Rural China," *American Political Science Review*: 101:2:355-372.

Stephen Ellis (1999), *The Mask of Anarchy: The Destruction of Liberia and the Religious Dimension of an African Civil War*, chs. 5-6 (191-280).

Recommended Readings:

Karen Guttieri and Jessica Piombo, eds. (2007), *Interim Governments: Institutional Bridges to Peace and Democracy?*

Max Weber, *Economy and Society*, Vol. 1: ch. 13, "Feudalism, *Ständestaat*, and Patrimonialism," Vol. 2: ch. XII and XIII (and you may wish to read Guenther Roth's introduction to Vol. 1, pp. xl-lvi).

7. March 26 Authoritarian (including Military) Regimes

William Stanley (1996), *The Protection Racket State: Elite Politics, Military Extortion, and Civil War in El Salvador*, Introduction (pp. 1-10).

Mary Callahan (2003), *Making Enemies: War and State Building in Burma*, preface (xi-xvi); introduction (1-20); epilogue (207-228), and if at all possible, chapters 5-7 (pp. 145-206).

Dan Slater, "Altering Authoritarianism: Institutional Complexity and Autocratic Agency in Indonesia," in Mahoney and Thelen eds., *Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power* (2010): 131-167

Thomas Pepinsky, 2014, "The Institutional Turn in Comparative Authoritarianism," *British Journal of Political Science*, 44:3 (July 2014): 631-653.

Baogang He and Mark E. Warren, "Authoritarian Deliberation: The Deliberative Turn in Chinese Political Development," *Perspectives on Politics* 9:2 (June 2011): 269-290.

Steven Heydemann, ed. (2000), *War, Institutions, and Social Change in the Middle East*, chapter 1 (pp. 1-30).

Sarah Aziza, "The Saudi Government's Global Campaign to Silence its Critics," *The New Yorker*, January 15, 2019.

Recommended:

Charles Tilly (1993), *Coercion, Capital and European States, AD 990-1992*, chs. 1, 2.

Ian S. Lustick (1997), "The Absence of Middle Eastern Great Powers: Political 'Backwardness' in Historical Perspective," *International Organization* 51:4 (Autumn): 653-683.

Antonio Giustozzi (2011), "Double-edged Swords: Armies, Elite Bargaining and State-Building," Crisis States Research Centre, Working Paper 86 (Series 2).
www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx

William Reno (1998), *Warlord Politics and African States*. (Concept of "Shadow State.")

Thomas Ertman (1997), *Birth of the Leviathan: Building States and Regimes in Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, chapter 1 (1-34).

Anton Blok (1988), *The Mafia of a Sicilian Village, 1860-1960: A study of violent peasant entrepreneurs*.

Sabine Kurtenbach (2011), "State-Building, War and Violence: Evidence from Latin America," GIGA Working Papers No. 181 (November).

8. & 9 April 2 and 9 Relation between Political Order and the Economy

Susan L. Woodward (1995), *Socialist Unemployment*, ch. 3 ("Creating a State for Socialist Development") and ch. 5 ("A Republic of Producers"): 64-97 and 164-190.

Catherine Boone (2014). *Property and Political Order in Africa: Land Rights and the Structure of Politics*, chs. 1, 2, and 11 (pp. 1-51, 309-332).

Mushtaq Husain Khan, et al., eds. (2004), *State Formation in Palestine: Viability and governance during a social transformation*, introduction and ch. 1 (pp. 1-63).

Mushtaq Khan (2010), *Political Settlements and the Governance of Growth-Enhancing Institutions* (read as much of the case studies – Thailand, Maharashtra, West Bengal, Bangladesh, and Tanzania – as you can and are interested).

John Braithwaite, "The Regulatory State?" in Rhodes, Binder, and Rockman, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Political Institutions*: 407-430.

Jeffrey A. Winters (2011), *Oligarchy*, preface, chapters 1, 4-6 (pp. 1-39, 135-285), and pp. 67-72 in ch. 3.

Karen Barkey (2008), *Empire of Difference: The Ottomans in Comparative Perspective*, ch. 7, "A Networking Society: Commercialization, Tax Farming, and Social Relations," 226-263.

Recommended Readings:

Alex de Waal, (2015) *The Real Politics of the Horn of Africa: Money, War, and the Business of Power*, pp. 174-195. [if you are interested, read the country chapters: Horn of Africa, Darfur, Sudan, South Sudan, Somalia, Somaliland, Eritrea, Ethiopia, and the final chapter, 196-218]

Alex de Waal (2009), "Mission without End? Peacekeeping in the African Political Marketplace," *International Affairs* 85: 1, 99-113.

James Mahoney (2010), *Colonialism and Post-Colonial Development: Spanish America in Comparative Perspective*, at a minimum, read chapters 1 and 8 (pp. 1-34; 253-70).

Martin Bøås and Kevin Dunn (2013), *Politics of Origin in Africa: Autochthony, citizenship and conflict*.

Karl Polanyi (1944), *The Great Transformation*.

Marcus Kurtz (2009), "The Social Foundations of Institutional Order: Reconsidering War and the 'Resource Curse' in Third World State Building," *Politics and Society* 37: 479 (pp. 479-520).

Sidney Tarrow (2015), *War, Rights, and Contention: A Comparative Historical Study*, introduction.

Norbert Elias (1982 [1939, 1969; 1976]), *Power and Civility*.

Perry Anderson (1974), *Lineages of the Absolutist State*.

Margaret Levi (1989), *Of Rule and Revenue*.

Janet Roitman (2005), *Fiscal Disobedience: An Anthropology of Economic Regulation in Central Africa*.

10. April 16 Political order in civil war contexts

Zachariah Cherian Mampilly (2011), *Rebel Rulers: Insurgent Governance and Civilian Life during War*, chapters 1-3, 7 (pp. 1-92, 209-230)

Paul Staniland (2012) "States, Insurgents, and Wartime Political Orders," *Perspectives on Politics*, 20:2 (June): 243-264.

Floor El Kamouni-Janssen, Hamzeh Shadeedi, and Nancy Ezzeddine, *Local Security Governance in Libya: Perceptions of Security and Protection in a Fragmented Country* (Clingendael, October 2018).

Ashley Jackson (June 2018), *Taliban Shadow Government* (Overseas Development Institute [ODI] Report) [this is 25 pages]

Susan L. Woodward (2001), "Compromised Sovereignty to Create Sovereignty: Is Dayton Bosnia a Futile Exercise or an Emerging Model?" in Steven Krasner, ed., *Problematic Sovereignty*: 252-300.

Bert Suykens, "Comparing Rebel Rule Through Revolution and Naturalization: Ideologies of Governance in Naxalite and Naga India," in Arjona, et al., eds., *Rebel Governance in Civil War*: 138-157.

John Braithwaite, Valerie Braithwaite, Michael Cookson and Leah Dunn, *Anomie and Violence: non-truth and reconciliation in Indonesian peacebuilding* (ANU Press: 2010): 1-35. (available online at: http://epress.anu.edu.au/anomie_citation.html)

Recommended Readings:

Alex Strick van Linschoten and Felix Kuehn (2018), *The Taliban Reader: War, Islam, and Politics*. The entire volume is useful, but if you want to look at how the Taliban is currently governing, see pp. 343-532.

Mao Tse-tung, translated by Samuel B. Griffith II, "Organization for Guerrilla Warfare, The Political Problems of Guerrilla Warfare, and Appendix," from *On Guerrilla Warfare* (Illinois UP 2000): 95-113.

Ana Arjona, Nelson Kasfir, and Zachariah Mampilly, eds. (2015), *Rebel Governance in Civil War*. (the next chapters to read, after Suykens, would be Stathis N. Kalyvas, "Rebel Governance During the Greek Civil War, 1942-1949: 119-137, and Till Förster, "Dialogue Direct: Rebel Governance and Civil Order in Northern Côte d'Ivoire": 203-225).

Samuel Popkin (1988), "Political Entrepreneurs and Peasant Movements in Vietnam," in Michael Taylor, ed., *Rationality and Revolution*: 9-62.

Tony Judt (2006), *Postwar: A History of Europe Since 1945*, Part One, 1945-53, is all about what it means to restart, transition, rebuild politically, socially, psychologically, etc., after WWII, which may have more parallels with other political transitional moments and contexts than might appear.

11. April 30 International Governance

Simon Chesterman (2004), *You, The People: The United Nations, Transitional Administration, and State-Building*, ch. 1, "Colonies and Occupied Territories: Transitional Administration Through the Twentieth Century," pp. 11-47.

Richard Caplan (2005), *International Governance of War-Torn Territories: Rule and Reconstruction*: ch. 1 (16-44).

Andrew Gilbert (2012), "Legitimacy Matters: Managing the Democratization Paradox of Foreign State-Building in Bosnia-Herzegovina," *Sudosteuroopa*, vol. 60, H. 4, Special Issue: "Research on State-Building in the Western Balkans: Comparative Methodologies."

Michael Hechter (2013), *Alien Rule*, ch. 1, 2, and 5 (1-45, 96-118).

Recommended Readings:

Peter M. R. Stirk (2009, 2012), *The Politics of Military Occupation*, chs. 1-3 (pp.1-95).

James D. Fearon and David D. Laitin, "Neotrusteeship and the Problem of Weak States," *International Security*, vol. 28, no. 4 (March 2004), 5-43.

Bertrand Badie (2000) (French original 1992), *The Imported State: The Westernization of the Political Order*.

Jarat Chopra, 2000. "The UN's Kingdom of East Timor," *Survival*, 42: 3 (Autumn): 27-39.

Stephen D. Krasner (2004), "Sharing Sovereignty: New Institutions for Collapsed and Failing States," *International Security*, 29: 2 (Fall): 85-120.

Renata Dwan and Laura Bailey, 2006. "Liberia's Governance and Economic Management Assistance Programme (GEMAP) (United Nations Peacekeeping Best Practices and World Bank, Fragile States Group: LICUS Initiative, May).

May 7 Class Presentations

May 14 Research Paper due, 5:00 p.m.